REGIONAL SEMINAR ON THE HARMONIZATION OF CYBERLEGISLATION IN ECOWAS

March, 23-24 March 2015

FINAL REPORT
UNCTAD Seminar on the Harmonisation of Legislation on Electronic Commerce within ECOWAS

Under the UNCTAD project to assist countries in the ECOWAS region to develop harmonised legislation on electronic commerce, the Division on Technology and Logistics organised a regional seminar from 23-24 March 2015 in Geneva as part of the UNCTAD E-Commerce Week.

The project is financed by the United Nations Development Account and the Government of Finland.¹

The project is also supported by the ECOWAS Commission and the African Union Commission in their efforts to ensure the implementation at national level of regional legal frameworks on electronic transactions (Supplementary Act A/SA.2/01/10), data protection (Supplementary Act A/SA.1/01/10) and cybercrime (Directive 1/08/11).

Fourty five representatives of the 15 ECOWAS countries participated in the seminar which provided an excellent platform to discuss ways and best practices to facilitate the implementation at the national level of existing regional legal frameworks.

The meeting was opened by Ms. Geneviève Féraud, Head of the Knowledge Development Branch, UNCTAD, and Her Excellency Ms. Nakpa Polo, Ambassador of the Permanent Mission of the Togolese Republic to the United Nations Office in Geneva.

Ms. Féraud gave an overview of the TrainForTrade project, which was launched in West Africa in 2012 and will run until the end of 2015. Its overall goal is to accelerate progress in West-African countries (Benin, Burkina Faso, the Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Mali, Senegal and Togo) towards the achievement of internationally agreed development goals, particularly MDG 8 through trade-related training and capacity building.

Ambassador Polo emphasized the need to create an enabling legal environment to reap benefits from information and communications technologies (ICTs). She thanked UNCTAD for supporting the building of capacities in the region.

Dr Raphael Koffi, Head of Telecommunication/ICT Division at the ECOWAS Commission thanked UNCTAD for having initiated this important Project and implemented for ECOWAS Member States. He also urged UNCTAD to pursue the assistance to ECOWAS in term of capacity building as well as developing and enacting legislation to complement the existing ones to ensure full development of e-commerce in the ECOWAS region.

Cyber legislation in the region needs to be further enhanced. Out the fifteen ECOWAS countries, seven had specific laws on e-transactions, 7 had data protection laws and 4 had adapted their legislation to cybercrime [see table 1].

His Excellency, Mr. Zotawon D, Titus, Deputy Minister, Department of ICT & Telecommunications, Ministry of Posts & Telecommunications, Liberia highlighted the challenges faced by the region and the need for such regional gathering: “ECOWAS countries are at different phases in implementing electronic transactions and such transactions need to be safeguarded. Hence, the need for stakeholders across the region to ensure the harmonization of cyber law across member states has implications for effective governance as cyber crimes knows no boundary. Essentially, this workshop has accentuated the need for policy makers, regulatory authorities and other such players responsible to drive the sustainable development of the sector to adopt common principles and approaches to achieve this objective. Addressing cyberlaw harmonization with a sense of urgency is one of such approaches.”
Representatives of the ECOWAS Commission, ITU, and UNCITRAL made presentations during the seminar.

The UNCITRAL representative appraised the state of existing legislation on electronic transactions and electronic signatures and the challenges that exist in the adoption of such legislation. The discussion clarified how ECOWAS member States could leverage UNCITRAL legal instruments to benchmark regional texts, such as those prepared by the African Union and the ECOWAS.

The ITU representative introduced participants to the challenges of helping ensure that security is made a key aspect of establishing e-commerce in the region as this affects the confidence of consumers and vendors alike. The representative then discussed the implementation of CERTs in the countries to respond to security incidents. The representative of the ECOWAS Commission also suggested complimenting the national CERTs with a regional CERT.

The ICANN representative addressed the issue of domain name management. She discussed how legal frameworks may be backed by technical investment to ensure that jurisdiction and development are properly attributed to the region as e-commerce develops. This tied into the taxation complexities that are introduced by e-commerce.

The representatives of ECOWAS, UNCITRAL, ITU and ICANN agreed that capacity-building activities were essential to strengthening the region’s efforts to implementing a secure cyberspace that encourages the use of ICTs and e-commerce.

**ELECTRONIC PAYMENTS**

The use of electronic payments in the region has grown tremendously in recent years, the most prevalent forms being mobile payments developed and implemented mostly by mobile network operators. Participants stressed the lack of interoperability between systems across countries. This impediment will hinder the growth of regional e-commerce.

Some participants felt that legislation should be used to address interoperability and that, at a regional level, ECOWAS should develop community legislation. However, the discussion reflected on the rapid pace of innovation in ICTs that would make it difficult to keep up and also the fact that legislation might turn out to be a stifling influence on development and investment.

**ELECTRONIC TRANSACTIONS**
The adoption of regional and national legislation on electronic transactions and electronic signatures based on a global uniform model was encouraged as this would ensure compatibility and thus facilitate, among others, mutual legal recognition of electronic signatures and certificates across borders.

DATA PROTECTION
On the issues data protection, member states are transposing the Supplementary Act on Data Protection into their national legislation. The seven countries that already have adopted the legislation indicated that there were still gaps with regard to developments in data processing.

CONSUMER PROTECTION
In terms of consumer protection, Cape Verde, Ghana, Liberia, Sierra Leone and Niger have already adopted legislation while the remaining countries are working on bills. As the francophone countries of ECOWAS have benefited from adopting the WAEMU Treaty text and have advanced more than the Anglophone countries, the Anglophone countries could benefit from modelling their own text and legislation on the existing work to reduce the time to implementation and to reduce the possibility of incompatibilities.

CHALLENGES
While almost all the countries had taken steps towards harmonising legislation on e-commerce, there were several common challenges;

• Rate of transposition at national level is very slow;
• The level of awareness is low of new laws among stakeholders, including the judiciary, consumers, civil society and private sector.
• More efforts are needed to build human resources to exploit the opportunities presented by the new legislation.
• The necessary institutional structures need to be established to support the implementation and enforcement of new legislation.
• Some countries (including Mali and Guinea) referred to institutional instability, lack of resources and limited capacity as obstacles to the implementation of legislation.

RECOMMENDATIONS
During the seminar, the following recommendations were agreed upon:

1. Make necessary efforts to accelerate the transposition of community texts at the national level;
2. Harmonise legislation on electronic transactions and electronic signatures, private data and consumer protection;
3. Actively pursue capacity building for policy makers and legislators, and information sharing with national stakeholders on knowledge such as that acquired through the seminar;
4. Advocate for more publicity on new laws when they come into force to ensure their effective use;
5. Establish a Regional CERT to reinforce the efforts of its member states by complementing their
6. Establish an information-sharing network to ensure that participants continue to share lessons learned and other experiences critical to the successful harmonisation of ecommerce legislation in the region;

7. On cybersecurity, ECOWAS countries should ratify the Convention on Cybersecurity and the Protection of Personal Data of the African Union;

8. UNCTAD should extend the training and technical capacity building, including through the online TrainForTrade platform, to the judiciary and the police;

9. Africa needs to work on the .africa domain and the promotion of utilising local domains.
### Table 1. Status of harmonization in the ECOWAS Member States as of December 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member Country</th>
<th>Electronic Transactions</th>
<th>Consumer Protection</th>
<th>Data Protection and Privacy</th>
<th>Cybercrime and Cybersecurity</th>
<th>On line content Regulation</th>
<th>Domain Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Benin</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cape Verde</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Côte d’Ivoire</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guinea</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guinea-Bissau</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sierra Leone</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Partial</td>
<td>Project</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Adopted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Summary of Opinion Questionnaires of the Seminar

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Percentage Distribution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The time allocated for this course was appropriate</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The number of participants was appropriate</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The course was well organized</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The training methodology was effective</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The training material was clear and accurate</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The coverage of the course subject was appropriate</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The depth at which the course explored the different topics was</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>appropriate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The quality of the written material (manuals, etc.) was good</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The quality of the visual aids (slides, videos, etc.) was good</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## PARTICIPANTS

### BENIN

**Hubert Arsène DADJO**  
Magistrat, Sous-Directeur Technique  
Ministère de la Justice

**Sévi Rodolphe ADJAIGBE**  
Chercheur en Droit, Chef du Service de la Réglementation  
Ministère de la Communication et des TIC

### Burkina Faso

**Lydie ZONGO**  
Directrice de la Promotion du e-commerce  
Ministère de l'Industrie du Commerce et de l'Artisanat

**Abdoulaye OUEDRAOGO**  
Directeur de la Réglementation des Communications électroniques  
Ministère du Développement de l'Économie numérique et des Postes

### IVORY COAST

**Kadio Hervé Honoré KOUA**  
Administrateur des Services Financiers, Sous-Directeur en charge du Commerce électronique  
Ministère du Commerce, Direction des Systèmes d'Information

**Héraclès Mayé ASSOKO**  
Directeur des Affaires Juridiques et de la Coopération internationale  
Ministère de la Poste et des TIC

### GUINÉA

**Saikou BALDE**  
Inspecteur Général adjoint  
Ministère du Commerce

**Fatiimatou BALDE**  
Chef de Section au Centre d'Appui aux Filières d'Exportation  
Ministère du Commerce

**Mama Tady CONDE**  
Directrice Générale  
EMAKO SARL

### MALI

**Fatoumata Sekou DICKO ep. MAIGA**  
Chef de Cabinet, Présidente de la Commission Technique d'Elaboration des Textes du Cadre TIC du Mali  
Ministère de la Justice et des Droits de l'Homme

**Boubacar Mahamane DICKO**  
Chargé Audit des Coûts et Interconnexion  
Autorité de Régulation des Télécommunications
Assetou SOUMARE
Responsable du Département des Affaires Juridiques et de la Règlementation
Société des Télécommunications du Mali (SOTELMA-SA)

Lamine Mahamadou DIALLO
Chef de Service au Département des Affaires Juridiques et Internationales
Autorité Malienne de Régulation des Télécommunications/TIC et Postes

Mahamane Laoualy ADO SALIFOU
Directeur des Affaires Juridiques et Contentieux
Ministère des Postes, des Télécommunications et de l’Économie Numérique

Atté BOEYI
Directeur de la Législation
Secrétariat général du Gouvernement

Yannick Olivier SOME
Assistant Juridique
Groupement Interbancaire Monétique de l’Union Economique et Monétaire Ouest Africain

Francois Mame Samba NDIAYE
Juriste
Observatoire de la Qualité des Services Financiers Ministère de l’Économie, des Finances et du Plan

Koku Vinyo GBADZI
Chef Division Réglementation et Contentieux
Ministère du Commerce, Direction du Commerce Intérieur et de la Concurrence

Dodzi Yawovi Sylvanus AWUTEY
Juriste
Autorité de Régulation des Postes et Télécommunications

Diakaria DIALLO
Responsable Réseaux et Sécurité
Présidence de la République

Baye Samba DIOP
Chef de Division Régulation et Affaires Juridiques
Autorité de Régulation des Marchés Publics (ARMP)

Ailine CONCEICAO
Attorney in the Study and Strategic Office
Agencia Nacional das Comunicacoes

THE GAMBIA
Regional Seminar on the Harmonization of Cyber Legislation in ECOWAS

Ebrima CEESAY
Legal, Licensing and Enforcement Manager
The Gambia Public Utilities Regulatory Authority

Sanusi DRAMMEH
ICT Officer
The Gambia Government

GHANA

Evelyn BEDIAKOH-ADU
Lawyer
National Communications Authority, Legal Division

Freda BENJAMIN-LAING
State Attorney
Ministry of Justice & Attorney General Office, Legislation Drafting Division

GUINEA-BISSAU

Suleimane MANE
Chief, Legal Affairs and Consumer Protection
Authority Regulation National Communication

LIBERIA

Roosevelt GOULD
Chief Lawyer
Ministry of Commerce and Industry

Zotawon TITUS
Deputy Minister in charge of ICT Ministry of Posts & Telecommunications

NIGERIA

Yakubu GONTOR
Assistant Director of Finance
Nigerian Communications Commission

Solomon I. INGBA
Deputy Director IT Ministry of Communication Technology

SIERRA LEONE

James COBBA
Chief Technology Officer Ministry of ICTs

Musa Bockarie KAMARA
ICT Manager Ministry of Trade and Industry

ECOWAS

Raphaël KOFFI
Chargé Principal de Programmes Chef de la Division Télécommunications/TIC Commission de la CEDEAO

INSTRUCTORS

Abdoullah CISSE
Avocat-Conseiller juridique Dakar BITEYE & CISSE Association

Ian WALDEN
Professor of Information and Communication Queen Mary, University of
London

SPEAKERS

Luca CASTELLANI
Legal Officer
UNCITRAL Regional Centre for Asia and the Pacific

Rosheen AWOTAR-MAUREE
Cybersecurity Officer
International Telecommunication Union

OBSERVERS

Emmanuel ADJOVI
Spécialiste de programme "Société de l'Information"
Direction de la Francophonie Numérique, Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie

Anne-Rachel INNE
VP Government Engagement
ICANN

Claudia GROSS
Legal Officer
UNCITRAL

Reform
ICT Analysis Section

Gogo Onodugo
Consultant
UNCTAD/ICT Analysis Section

Smita LAKHE
Statistics Assistant
UNCTAD/ICT Analysis Section

Dominique CHANTREL
Distance Learning Specialist
UNCTAD/TrainForTrade

Aylwin ZABULA
Information Systems Officer
UNCTAD/TrainForTrade

Stephanie GARCIA
Administrative Assistant
UNCTAD/TrainForTrade

UNCTAD

Cécile BARAYRE-EI SHAMI
Programme Manager
Electronic Commerce and Law