



# In-Country Needs Assessment Mission Report (July 2018)

Rajesh Sreenivasan, Tanya Tang and Dominique Chantrel
10 August 2018

### **RAJAH & TANN SINGAPORE LLP**

Project financed by the United Nations Development Account and implemented by UNCTAD







# **CONTENTS**

1 -	– Introduction	2
2 -	- Mission Report: The Philippines (9 – 10 July 2018)	3
	2.1 - Summary of Meetings Held	3
	2.2 - Internal Preparatory Meeting	3
	2.3 - Stakeholder Consultation	5
	2.4 - Photos of Meetings Held	7
3 -	- Mission Report: Indonesia (16 – 18 July 2018)	9
	3.1 - Summary of Meetings Held	9
	3.2 - Internal Preparatory Meeting	9
	3.3 - Stakeholder Consultation	9
	3.4 - Meeting with ASEAN Representative	11
	3.5 - Photos of Meetings Held	12
4	- Mission Report: Singapore (20 - 24 July 2018)	14
	4.1 - Summary of Meetings Held	14
	4.2 - Meeting with GovTech	14
	4.3 - Meeting with Ministry of Trade and Industry (MTI)	15
	4.3 - Photos of Meetings Held	16
	4.4 - Meeting with UNCITRAL	16
	4.5 - Meeting with APEC Secretariat	16
A	nnex 1. Attendance List for Internal Preparatory Meeting with Philippines DTI	17
A	nnex 2. Attendance List for Philippines Stakeholder Consultation	18
Α	nnex 3. Attendance List for Indonesia Stakeholder Consultation	21

### 1 – Introduction

Rajah & Tann Singapore LLP (R&T) has been engaged by the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) as the legal consultants (the "Legal Consultants") to assist in the development of a training package to strengthen the capacities of policy-makers and practitioners from selected countries in South-East Asia on e-Commerce to promote inclusive and sustainable development ("Project"). Financed by the United Nations Development Account Tranche 11, ref: 1819N.

Information and communications technologies (ICTs) have been recognised as a key enabler for ASEAN's social and economic integration as evidenced in the ASEAN ICT Masterplan 2015 and 2020, as well as the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) Blueprint 2025, which set specific measures to build a digitally-enabled regional economy and encourage the development of electronic commerce. Ecommerce is indeed seen as a key component for ASEAN to realise its vision of a regionally integrated economy. However, like many developing countries, ASEAN Member States are to some extent inadequately prepared to capture the many opportunities emerging as a result of e-commerce. Some of the key challenges in promoting e-commerce in the region include concerns on cybersecurity, lack of trust in online transactions, and lack of strong methods of authentication to tackle the fraud and underpin electronic transactions. There is also an increasing demand from the region to identify enabling policies and best practices that will accelerate the development of e-commerce.

The TrainForTrade Project developed in collaboration with UNCTAD/ICT Analysis Section, is designed to address these challenges and demand in e-commerce development and has received interest from three ASEAN countries, namely Indonesia, the Philippines and Singapore. Although these countries have already made great advances in the adoption of e-commerce laws as well as in building national e-commerce ecosystems, with Singapore being recognised as the leader in the region in this field, they are all facing challenges and are looking at ways to strengthen the security of e-commerce users and the entrepreneurs' capabilities to engage in e-commerce. Working with these three countries at different levels of development will also promote an understanding of how policies and standards can facilitate cross-border e-commerce in the region.

The objective of the Project is to promote best practices and evidence-based policies on e-commerce by delivering capacity-building activities at two levels on e-commerce: Best Practices in e-Commerce; and Strengthening Capacities on Digital Authentication Methods. The Legal Consultants are responsible for developing the training package on Strengthening Capacities on Digital Authentication Methods.

To kickstart the Project, a needs assessment mission to Manila, Jakarta and Singapore was conducted in July 2018. The objective was to meet with the key stakeholders (policy-makers and entrepreneurs) in each of the beneficiary countries to:

Present the Project to relevant stakeholders from the public and private sectors and get their feedback regarding the project objectives;

Understand the specific challenges pertaining to each country with regard to using and securing e-commerce, as well as the different projects and initiatives that have been put in place by public and private sector actors in these two areas with a view to adapt the training packages to the national and regional context; and

Assess local technical capacities and constraints for the subsequent training deliveries.

As part of the engagement, R&T was requested to participate in the needs assessment mission. The sessions in the Philippines and Indonesia were attended by Tanya and her colleagues from the local R&T offices in Manila and Jakarta. The sessions in Singapore were attended by Tanya and Rajesh.

The results of the needs assessment mission will be used for the next step of the development and validation of the capacity building training package (including the DACUM phase to be held in Geneva in September 2018).

This report summarises the discussions that took place during the needs assessment mission.

# 2 - Mission Report: The Philippines (9 – 10 July 2018)

# 2.1 - Summary of Meetings Held

Date/Time	Description	Participants
9 July 2018, 9.15am	Internal preparatory meeting	Department of Trade & Industry Industry Development & Trade Policy Group (IDTPG) Bureau of Trade and Industrial Policy Research (BTIPR) E-Commerce Office (ECO) Philippine Accreditation Bureau (PAB) UNCTAD: Dominique Chantrel R&T: Tanya Tang, Mary Thel T. Mundin and Vladi Miguel S. Lazaro (Refer to Annex 1)
10 July 2018, 1pm	Stakeholder consultation	Mixture of private sector and public sector participants UNCTAD: Dominique Chantrel R&T: Tanya Tang, Mary Thel T. Mundin and Vladi Miguel S. Lazaro (Refer to Annex 2)

### 2.2 - Internal Preparatory Meeting

The meeting opened with Dominique briefly describing the Project objectives and structure.

The Philippine representatives, led by Director Maria Lourdes A. Yaptinchay, expressed support and appreciation for the Project. Director Maria Lourdes is also the focal point designated for the Project for the Philippines.

It was discussed that the key underlying legislation for e-commerce have been passed, such as the Electronic Commerce Act of 2000<sup>1</sup>, the Data Privacy Act of 2012<sup>2</sup>, Cybercrime Prevention Act of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Republic Act No. 8792

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Republic Act No. 10173

2012 <sup>3</sup>, Implementing Rules and Regulations (IRR) on Electronic Authentication and Electronic Signatures<sup>4</sup> (as well as other ensuing rules/implementing guidelines on electronic signatures).

The Philippine representatives noted that the key issues / areas for further development are as follows:

Taxation – They noted that the Bureau of Internal Revenue (BIR) has been strongly pushing for the imposition of taxes on e-commerce. The tax bureau had been in talks with start-ups to develop an application to track e-commerce sales. The meeting noted that the issue of taxation would have an impact on cross-border e-commerce trade.

Consumer protection - There are ongoing efforts to apply the consumer protection laws to e-commerce transactions. This includes the issuance of Rules and Regulations for Consumer Protection in a Transaction Covered by the Consumer Act of the Philippines (R.A. 7394) through Electronic Means under the E-Commerce Act (R.A. 8792).<sup>5</sup>

The Philippines is also establishing an online dispute mechanism to promote a trusted environment for e-commerce. At the ASEAN level, there have also been commitments to build a regional online dispute resolution system and interagency coordination mechanism to improve consumer protection in e-commerce.

Logistics – Logistics remains a major pain point for e-commerce players in the Philippine market. As the Philippines is an archipelago, it may be cheaper for e-commerce players to transport their products overseas than within the country. The provision of reliable courier services, particularly in the countryside, continues to be a major problem. It has been observed that logistics providers are partnering with the post offices to expand their coverage.

Payments systems – Cash on Delivery (COD) remains the preferred mode for payments for e-commerce transactions, although its use has dropped from 90% to 70% of e-commerce transactions. COD presents some difficulties for merchants as there is a risk that the logistics partner would not remit the cash back to the merchant. Banks are working with telecom companies to provide mobile payment services (such as Globe Telecom's GCash), with the Central Bank (*Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas*) taking a progressive approach towards electronic payments.

Digital Signatures and ID – This is one area for policy development. The Government has not received applications for certification authorities, although there was previously interest from foreign-owned companies. The Philippines is in the process of rolling out a national ID system.

The Philippine representatives opined that as an institutional matter to drive e-commerce, it would be useful to make the E-Commerce Office as a permanent office in the DTI. It would also be valuable to establish a council for e-commerce with representatives from the Government and the private sector. Although there is an industry association, i.e., Digital Commerce Association of the Philippines (DCOM),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Republic Act No. 10175

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> DTI-DOST Joint Department Administrative Order No. 2, Series of 2001

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Joint DTI-DOH-DA Administrative Order No. 01, Series of 2008

its membership is still small. It was noted that the DTI's Business Centres (Negosyo Centers) in the rural areas are helping to promote e-commerce amongst the Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs).

Dr Rafaelita M. Aldaba, Supervising Assistant Secretary for E-Commerce, joined the meeting mid-way. She noted that the DTI is working on updating the PhilippineE-Commerce Roadmap 2016-2020 by the end of this year. To this end, the ongoing needs assessment mission is very timely and relevant to the DTI's own workstream. She requested the UN to consider if a presentation could be made in Manila in October 2018 to present its findings from the mission. DTI would then organise a forum to gather more feedback from stakeholders and prepare a policy brief on e-commerce.

#### 2.3 - Stakeholder Consultation

The meeting was well-attended by a mixture of public and private sector participants, including representatives from the Central Bank (*Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas*), Bureau of Internal Revenue, Philippine Ports Authority, DTI bureaus/attached agencies (e.g., Consumer Protection and Advocacy Bureau, Fair Trade Enforcement Bureau, Bureau of Philippine Standards, Export Marketing Bureau, et.al), Philippine Retailers Association, and the Game Developers Association of the Philippines, among others.

Dominique began by giving a presentation on the Project, including its background and objectives, a brief description of the two courses to be developed, the training process as well as the expected results. He shared that similar courses on e-commerce best practices have already been developed for Africa and Latin America — the intention is to adapt the content for ASEAN according to the level of development in the region and the needs of stakeholders.

Key comments/queries from the participants included the following:

- A representative from the Central Bank (Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas) suggested including a
  module on consumer protection and the responsibilities of the parties to ensure consumer
  protection. She opined that the low level of consumer trust is one reason for low take-up of ecommerce in the Philippines.
- A representative from the Philippine Retailers Association suggested providing a secure retailer mark for e-commerce (similar to in Europe) to increase consumer confidence in the security and authenticity of e-commerce sites. Another participant suggested including a module on how to better identify rogue or bogus e-commerce merchants, and to prove the relationship between the seller and the buyer as part of consumer protection.
- A representative from the Game Developers Association of the Philippines noted that
  consumers in the Philippines appear more reluctant to pay for digital content/goods (e.g.
  online games) as they are not physical. She noted that e-commerce may therefore require a
  change in consumer mindset. The DTI agreed that intangibles are part of the difficulty in
  ASEAN negotiations on e-commerce a number of countries have difficulty committing to
  cross-border flow of information.

- A representative from a network services company (InterCommerce) noted that the issues for local vs cross-border trade are different. Dominique agreed that businesses should also be thinking about e-commerce on a local/regional level and not just international.
- A representative from the Bureau of Philippine Standards (BPS) suggested for the course to cover the best practices on use of data standards and data privacy. He noted that the Philippines is in the process of harmonising the standards for data privacy in ASEAN.
- Director Maria Lourdes raised the issue of the liability of marketplaces. She noted that there is an express provision in the E-Commerce Act that there is no liability on service providers the provision is targeted at Internet Service Providers as marketplaces were not common when the law was passed in 2000. The representative highlighted the existence of the Manila Principles on Intermediary Liability<sup>6</sup> which support expansive protections from liability for intermediaries, derived from the notion that intermediaries should not be held liable for content produced by others. The question is whether liability should be imposed on the marketplace or on the merchants.
- A participant suggested strengthening the private sector's capabilities in marketing, research
  and improving market access. She noted that small-scale sellers generally lack the ability and
  means to market their products their access to markets tend to be limited by platform
  providers, search providers etc.

In response to queries about the training process and the selection of training participants, Dominique explained that the participants should comprise a mixture of government and private sector participants (which should in turn come from both Manila and the provinces). Dominique further explained that the training is a two-step process – the first being an online course and the second being a face-to-face workshop for participants. The workshop may also be attended by participants from other ASEAN member states who are willing to incur their own expenses to attend the workshop.

Dominique noted that the training course provides the framework as well as fora to discuss policy gaps, and is a means of capacity building in the long-run. If there is demand, it may be possible to customise the course further for the Philippine market (e.g., in terms of content and language), and to expand the reach to allow for more participants.

Dominique and Tanya invited all stakeholders (even those who were unable to attend the meeting) to provide their comments and suggestions for the course development by email to Dominique by the beginning of September 2018.

DTI Director Maria Lourdes added that the DTI will be inviting the relevant stakeholders to other consultation sessions as part of the DTI's ongoing efforts to update the Philippine E-Commerce Roadmap.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> https://www.manilaprinciples.org/

# 2.4 - Photos of Meetings Held



Internal preparatory meeting



Stakeholder consultation



Stakeholder consultation



Stakeholder consultation

# 3 - Mission Report: Indonesia (16 – 18 July 2018)

# 3.1 - Summary of Meetings Held

Date/Time	Description	Participants		
16 July 2018, 11.45am	Internal preparatory meeting	<ul> <li>Ministry of Foreign Affairs</li> <li>Ministry of Communication and Information Technology</li> <li>UNCTAD: Dominique Chantrel</li> <li>R&amp;T: Tanya Tang and Farid Nasution</li> </ul>		
17 July 2018, 9 am	Stakeholder consultation	Representatives from Ministry of Communication and Information Technology, Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Trade     UNCTAD: Dominique Chantrel     R&T: Tanya Tang and Farid Nasution (Refer to Annex 3)		
18 July 2018, 1pm	Meeting with ASEAN Representative	Budi Yuwono, Senior Officer, ICT & Tourism Division, Sectoral Development Directorate, ASEAN Economic Community Department      UNCTAD: Dominique Chantrel     R&T: Tanya Tang		

# 3.2 - Internal Preparatory Meeting

The meeting was an informal discussion over lunch with representatives from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology.

Dominique briefly described the Project objectives.

Mr Tri Purnajaya, Director for Trade Commodities and Intellectual Property from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, expressed concerns that only 50 participants would be selected for Indonesia, given the size of the country. He opined that Indonesia should be allocated with more participation slots.

Dominique explained that this is how the Project would be run under ASEAN. If there is demand, it may be possible to customise the course further for the Indonesia market (e.g., in terms of content and language), and to expand the reach to allow for more participants.

#### 3.3 - Stakeholder Consultation

The meeting was attended by representatives from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Trade, Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (MCIT) and Coordinating Ministry of Economic Affairs. It was clarified that MCIT will be the focal point for this Project for Indonesia, working with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Director Tri noted that the outcome of the Project is to have more experts on e-commerce. Dominique added that the online nature of the course is to expand coverage and reach, especially to people outside of Jakarta. Dominique explained that if there is demand, it may be possible to customise the course further for the Indonesia market (e.g., in terms of content and language), and to further expand the reach.

Dominique noted that as an administrative matter for the Project, UNCTAD is pending a letter from Indonesia to request for assistance.

Director Tri noted that the Project is timely and relevant for the country and region. At a country-level, Indonesia has the E-Commerce Roadmap 2017-2019. At a regional level, the Project is in line with the ASEAN connectivity development, which has a three-prong roadmap:

- Institutional connectivity
- Physical connectivity
- Social / soft connectivity

Director Tri noted that this Project is more targeted at improving the soft connectivity elements by increasing skills and capacity.

Director Tri further noted that e-commerce can unlock huge potential for Indonesia. For this to happen, national connectivity must be improved. The public sector must also work hand in hand. Trade is a tool to achieve national objectives, and e-commerce will be a large component of global trade in the future.

A representative from the Coordinating Ministry of Economic Affairs noted that e-commerce holds particularly big potential for the SMEs and cooperative units. He noted that many of them are currently shipping out of Indonesia rather than being market makers. He opined that it would be beneficial to have more efficient regulators in this area and to receive technical assistance on how to create base data.

A representative from MCIT noted the relatively long timeline for the Project (between now and the final presentation in 2020), and enquired on how UNCTAD can ensure the training would be a success. Dominique noted that the different stages of the Project can be treated separately (e.g., the online course participants may not be involved in the final workshop). He also added that UNCTAD has a long experience running such courses.

Director Tri enquired about the participant selection for the Project. Dominique responded that it is recommended that the participants consist of a mixture of private and public sector participants. Dominique noted that the Government can work via associations to solicit private sector participation.

Mukti of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs requested for clarity on the detailed mechanism and rules for the Project. For example, what would happen if a participating staff were to switch departments or resign from the Government halfway through the training.

Dominique responded that UNTAD training courses are run in a similar manner to the WTO courses. If Indonesia is concerned about people dropping out from the training, it could select up to 60 participants at the start. However, since this is an e-learning course that is open to both the public and private

sectors, the participant could stay on the course even if he/she switches departments or leaves the government.

Dominique informed that the deadline is September 2018 for stakeholders to provide their inputs to UNCTAD for the course development. The meeting noted that the Expert Group on E-Commerce in the Coordinating Ministry is likely to create an internal memo to solicit inputs for provision to UNCTAD.

As a preliminary matter, the participants noted that they see the need for capacity building in the following areas:

- Consumer protection
- Incentivising SMEs to adopt e-commerce
- Tax categorisation
- Financial issues
- Infrastructure for SMEs
- Logistics
- Digital authentication
- Intellectual property rights (IPR)

On IPR, Dominique noted that this falls under the jurisdiction of WIPO, and is outside the scope of the Project.

When asked about how the process is internally structured in other countries like the Philippines, Dominique explained that the Ministry of Trade has a department for e-commerce, which is responsible for coordinating. Dominique opined that it is important for Indonesia to identify who in the Ministry should be involved.

#### 3.4 - Meeting with ASEAN Representative

Dominique provided Budi with a brief introduction to the Project.

Budi explained that the process in ASEAN is for concepts to be discussed with the sector and to obtain inputs from all ASEAN Member States. Implementation will begin once the concept is endorsed by ASEAN Member Dtates.

Budi noted that the ASEAN Coordinating Committee on Electronic Commerce (ACCEC) will be meeting in Singapore in August 2018. He offered to circulate the Project information materials to the relevant persons to gather comments from stakeholders.

Budi noted that the ASEAN Member States are at different stages of development and that a one-size-fits-all approach would be difficult.

On the topics to cover in the training, Budi opined that the following would be of interest:

- Taxation
- Payment
- Transport and logistics
- Digital marketing responsible marketing and consumer protection
- Marketplaces

Dominique enquired where might be a good location in Jakarta to host the Regional Restitution Workshop which will be held in Indonesia in 2020. Mr Budi opined that it could be either be held at the Ministry or ASEAN building, and noted that there would be a new ASEAN building by then.

Budi opined that the Project is likely to be supported by the ASEAN Member States, who are generally in favour of capacity building (as compared with policy formulation exercises).

Budi offered to be the point of contact if UNCTAD needed any assistance in delivering messages to ASEAN on the Project.

# 3.5 - Photos of Meetings Held



Internal preparatory meeting



Stakeholder consultation



Stakeholder consultation

# 4 - Mission Report: Singapore (20 - 24 July 2018)

# 4.1 - Summary of Meetings Held

Date/Time	Description	Participants
20 July 2018, 2 pm	Meeting with GovTech	<ul> <li>GovTech: Kwok Quek Sin and Ott Sarv</li> <li>UNCTAD: Dominique Chantrel</li> <li>R&amp;T: Rajesh Sreenivasan and Tanya Tang</li> </ul>
24 July 2018, 9.30am	Meeting with Ministry of Trade and Industry	<ul> <li>MTI: Karen Yeo and Foo Cher How</li> <li>UNCTAD: Dominique Chantrel and Yann Duval</li> <li>R&amp;T: Tanya Tang</li> </ul>

# 4.2 - Meeting with GovTech

The meeting opened with Dominique briefly describing the Project objectives.

Mr Kwok Quek Sin, Senior Director (National Digital Identity), proceeded to take the meeting through a presentation on Singapore's National Digital Identity (NDI) project, which is being spearheaded by GovTech. NDI is intended to be a digital enabler which tackles identity, authorisation and consent. Quek Sin shared many envisaged use cases for NDI to illustrate how it could be used to improve the lives of citizens.

Quek Sin noted that many other countries have implemented eID projects since the early 2000s. The Singapore Government has been evaluating eID for a long time and has taken the view that mobile phones have now reached the level of pervasiveness and acceptable security to serve as a usable form factor for digital transactions. That said, the Singapore Government is not ruling out the use of different form factors (e.g., embedded SIMs).

Quek Sin raised the concept of multi-tier identity assurance – as people transact more, the identity assurance level goes up and relying services can have flexibility to decide what levels of transaction to allow.

A related issue concerns issuing an identity to foreigners, and how the validation of foreigners' identities can be performed.

Another issue is cross-border authentication and Singapore is looking at the European model in this regard. If every country has a national certification authority of a certain standard, it may be possible to allow for cross recognition. Singapore is looking for suitable countries for bilateral arrangements in this regard. Quek Sin noted that Indonesia and Malaysia have eID initiatives, but that these are privately run.

Regarding consumer protection and privacy, Quek Sin noted that Singapore has basic protection in the form of its Personal Data Protection Act ("**PDPA**"). The PDPA makes clear that individual consent is a basic requirement, and does not allow for blanket consent.

Quek Sin noted that because the trust ecosystem involves the private sector, there would be issues about cost, liability, and commercial models. Other challenges to be addressed are issues like the right to be forgotten and the right for data portability.

In closing, Quek Sin noted that some other Government entities for whom the Project may be relevant include the Ministry of Trade and Industry, Singapore Customs, Infocomm Media Development Authority and Enterprise Singapore which are looking into the digitalisation of businesses, as well as the Monetary Authority of Singapore.

# 4.3 - Meeting with Ministry of Trade and Industry (MTI)

The meeting opened with Dominique briefly describing the Project objectives.

Ms Karen Yeo, Senior Assistant Director (ASEAN Division), expressed support for the Project, noting that Singapore is midway through its chairmanship of ASEAN, for which the digital economy and ecommerce are the focus areas. Digital e-commerce deliverables are expected by the end of the year.

Karen noted that the Project would be too late for the ASEAN 2018 conversation, but that there will be ongoing conversations on e-commerce for the next three to four years.

She informed that internally, there is a big team focused on e-commerce, with GovTech leading the digital authentication angle and MTI leading the commerce angle. To this end, MTI has been engaging the Singapore Business Federation as well as think-tanks such as the Singapore Institute on International Affairs, the Asian Business Law Institute and the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies on lowering the barriers to e-commerce for SMEs.

Karen suggested that the Project could dovetail with the events for next year. Karen also suggested that the Project could be part of the Initiative for ASEAN Integration (IAI) to support other countries in ASEAN.

Karen noted from the RCEP negotiations regarding e-commerce that there are difficulties coordinating across different regimes.

Karen offered to take the following actions with respect to the Project:

- Check with the Geneva mission to see how they could support the Project;
- Send the relevant materials through the ASEAN Secretariat to share with the ASEAN Member States; and
- Check with her Indonesian and Philippines counterparts to ensure a coordinated approach.

# 4.3 - Photos of Meetings Held



Meeting with Ministry of Trade and Industry

# 4.4 - Meeting with UNCITRAL

A working lunch was organised with UNCITRAL in Singapore.

M. Luca Castellani agree to collaborate on this project when it come to the specific area of law and Identity management. UNCITRAL is working on update Legal Issues Related to Identity Management and Trust Services.

# 4.5 - Meeting with APEC Secretariat

With the collaboration of UNESCAP, a meeting with APEC (Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation) was organised and M. Akhmad Bayhaqi, Senior Analyst, who presented some publication in this area. The most advanced discussion on Identity Management is contained in doc. A/CN.9/936 - Report of Working Group IV (Electronic Commerce) on the work of its fifty-sixth session (New York, 16–20 April 2018), paras. 47-94

# Annex 1. Attendance List for Internal Preparatory Meeting with Philippines DTI

#### Attendance Sheet

# Preparatory Meeting for UNCTAD Needs Assessment Mission/Stakeholders Consultation

4/F Conference Room, Industry and Investment Building, 385 Senator Gil Puyat Avenue, Makati City, 1200 09 July 2018

	Position	Contact Number	Signature
IDTPG			The second secon
Dr. Rafaelita M. Aldaba	Supervising Assistant Secretary for E- Commerce		
UNCTAD			
Mr. Dominique Chantrel	Programme Management Officer	+41792369462	Suntiel
Rajah & Tann LLP		AND AND COME AND	
Ms. Tanya Tang	Partha (Chief Francinic + Policy Advisor	n 45 97570120.	£ .
Mary Thel T. Mundin	partner, C26 Law	0988 815 9870	m
Vladi Miguel S. Lazaro	Patrix, C+6 (aw	8940377	m
BTIPR			/
Ms. Maria Lourdes A. Yaptinchay	Director	+ 63 917 8as 6971	Edyaptin chay
Ms. Maria Crispina S. Reodica	Chief TIDS	976-5700 loc. 5106/+19917863	3442 MARINAMAKANA
Ms. Alyanna Victoria M. Rivera	STIDS	+632 897 1243	armine
Mr. Arnold Janssen D. Saragena	TIDS	tuzz 891 1247 to 3911 7050878	
E-Commerce Office			1
Mr. Oliver O. Ramallosa	Senior E-Commerce Specialist	895-3198 (0977236 5344)	alles
Ms. Lilibelle T. Mongaya	E-Commerce Analyst	895-3198 (1439425941347)	Thousand
PAB			
Mr Prnani M. Dionisjo	Oirector III		mid. D.

# Annex 2. Attendance List for Philippines Stakeholder Consultation

# **Government attendees:**

Agency Name	Name	Designation	Contact Number	Email Address
Banko Sentral ng Pilipinas (BSP)	Maricris A. Salud			SaludMA@bsp.gov.ph
Board of Investments (BOI)	Ryan T. Ramos			rtramos@boi.gov.ph
Bureau of Internal Revenue (BIR)	Carolyn Ann C. Reyes	Director		
Bureau of the Treasury	Mark Edward Castro			
Buleau of the Heasury	Ingming Aberia			aberia.ingming@gmail.com
Department of Information and Communications Technology(DICT)	Emmylou V. Delfin			
Bureau of Domestic Trade Promotion (BDTP)	Ann Ropa-Malhotra	Supervising TIDS		
Bureau of Import Services (BIS)	Daisy R. Villanueva			
Buleau of Import Services (BIS)	Pearl Joy C. Sumaria			
D ( late on a Constitution la	Marietta B. Trimpe			MariettaTrimpe@dti.gov.ph
Bureau of International Trade Relations (BITR)	Maria Anne Lorraine S. Doong			MariaAnneLorraineDoong@dti.gov.ph
Bureau of Philippine Standards (BPS)	Avelino T. Molina Jr			
	Maria Lourdes A. Yaptinchay	Director		MariaLourdesYaptinchay@dti.gov.ph
Bureau of Trade and Industrial Policy Research (BTIPR)	Maria Crispina S. Reodica	Chief TIDS		MariaCrispinaReodica@dti.gov.ph
	Alyanna Victoria M. Rivera	STIDS		AlyannaVictoriaRivera@dti.gov.ph

Agency Name	Name	Designation	Contact Number	Email Address
	Arnold Janssen D. Saragena	TIDS		ArnoldJanssenSaragena@dti.gov.ph
Consumer Protection and	Emma A. Panopio	Chief TIDS		EmmaPanopio@dti.gov.ph
Advocacy Bureau(CPAB)	Ronald C. Calderon			RonaldCalderon@dti.gov.ph
E-Commerce Office (ECO)	Oliver O. Ramallosa	Senior E-Commerce Specialist		OliverRamallosa@dti.gov.ph
	Lilibelle T. Mongaya	E-Commerce Analyst		LilibelleMongaya@dti.gov.ph
Export Markeing Bureau (EMB)	Mr. Victorino S. Soriano	Chief TIDS		VictorinoSoriano@dti.gov.ph
Export Markeing Bureau (EMB)	Ms. Maria Teresa S. Loring	Supervising TIDS		MariaTeresaLoring@dti.gov.ph
Fair Trade Enforcement Bureau	Rosita P. Jaleco	Chief TIDS, PSMD		RositaJaleco@dti.gov.ph
(FTEB)	Rosila F. Egmilan	Chief TIDS, SDP		RosilaEgmilan@dti.gov.ph
	Marygene F. Montenegro	Acting Department Manager		
Philippine Ports Authority (PPA)	Nanette C. Baguio	Acting Human Resource Management Officer III		
	John Leonardi H. Duque	Management Information/Systems Development Chief A		
Philippine Trade Training Center (PTTC)	Jomel Lozada	Planning Officer I		jomellozada@pttc.gov.ph

# Private sector attendees

Agency Name	Name	Designation	Contact Number	Email Address
United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD)	Mr. Dominique Chantrel	Programme Management Officer	+41 22 9172187	dominique.chantrel@unctad.org
Rajah & Tann LLP	Ms. Tanya Tang	Partner (Chief Economic and Policy Advicer)		
	Ms. Mary Thel T. Mundin	Partner (C & G Law)		thel.mundin@cagatlaw.com
	Mr. Vladi Miguel S. Lazaro	Partner (C & G Law)		vmslazaro@cagatlaw.com
Game Developers Association of the Philippines	Ms. Ria Lu			
InterCommerce Network Services	Mr. Francis Norman O. Lopez	President	843-8182	flopez@intercommerce.com.ph
	Ms. Rosemarie B. Ong	President		
	Atty. Paul A. Santos	Chairman		
Philippine Retailers Association	Ms. Mayan Sangil	Advocacy Communications Officer		
	Ms. Evelyn B. Salire	Secretary General		
	Ms. Ana Marie Miranda	Asst. Secretary General		
Philippine Computer Emergency Response Team	Angel Averia	President		litoaveria@gmail.com

# Annex 3. Attendance List for Indonesia Stakeholder Consultation

No	Name	Organisation	Email Address	Telephone Number
1.	Tanya Tang	R&T Singapore	tanya.tang@rajahtann.com	+6597570120
2.	Chantrel	UNCTAD	dominique.chantrel@un.org	+41792309462
3.	Farid Nasution	AHP	farid.nasution@ahp.co.id	085214233991
4.	Catur Atmo S.N	Kemendag	catur.atmos@gmail.com	083806426326
5.	Ganesha M. Lubis	Kemenko Perekonomian	ganeshalubis@gmail.com	087775978485
6.	Wiwi Uliyati	Kemenko Perekonomian	wiwiuliyati@gmail.com	087886529424
7.	Tri Purnajaya	Direktur PKKI		
8.	Nanci	Kemenkominfo	nanc11@kominfo.go.id	08126300244
9.	Yoga Sangkar	Kemenkominfo	yoga001@kominfo.go.id	085310411258
10.	Yana Rudiyana	Kemlu	rudiyana@kemlu.go.id	+62 21 381 2133
11.	Mukti R. Setiantio	Kemlu	mukti.setianto@kemlu.go.id	+62 821-11188131